

# Tradition & Discovery

## The Polanyi Society Periodical

Volume XXXIX

Number 2

2012--2013

---

---

Preface.....	2
News and Notes (with Annual Meeting Call for Papers).....	3
Polanyi Society Board Minutes.....	5
Treasurer's Report.....	7
"Tihamér Margitay on Polanyi's Ontology: An Introduction".....	9
Phil Mullins	
"Multiple Paths to Ontology: Recasting Margitay's Critique of Polanyi".....	10
Walter Gulick	
Electronic Discussion List.....	15
"On Margitay's Notion of Reduction by Definition".....	16
Gergely Kertész	
Submissions for Publication.....	21
"What Engineers Can Do but Physicists Can't: Polanyi and Margitay on Machines".....	22
David W. Agler	
Notes on Contributors.....	26
"Does Polanyi's Thought Affirm A 'Correspondence Thesis'?".....	27
John V. Apczynski	
"Emergent Knowledge and Its Challenge to Reductionist Thought".....	29
Mihály Héder	
"Margitay on Emergence and Ontological Hierarchy".....	35
Kyle Takaki	
"Polanyi's Ontology <i>from Inside</i> : A Reply to My Critics".....	42
Tihamér Margitay	
Reviews.....	59
Jonathan Haidt, <i>The Righteous Mind: Why Good People Are Divided by Politics and Religion</i> Paul Lewis	
Michael S. Hogue, <i>The Promise of Religious Naturalism</i> Diane Yeager	
Victor Lee Austin, <i>Up with Authority</i> Trevor Anderson	

# The Polanyi Society

## General Editor-Tradition & Discovery

Paul Lewis  
Roberts Department of Christianity  
Mercer University  
1400 Coleman Avenue  
Macon, GA 31207  
(478)301-4166 fax (478) 301-2384  
[LEWIS\\_PA@mercer.edu](mailto:LEWIS_PA@mercer.edu)

David Rutledge, **Board President**  
Department of Religion  
Furman University  
Greenville, SC 29613-6298  
[David.Rutledge@furman.edu](mailto:David.Rutledge@furman.edu)

Diane Yeager, **Board Vice President**  
Theology Department  
Georgetown University  
37th and O Streets, NW  
Washington, DC 20057  
[yeagerd@georgetown.edu](mailto:yeagerd@georgetown.edu)

Dale Cannon, **Board Secretary**  
Division of Humanities  
Western Oregon University  
Monmouth, OR 97361 USA  
[cannodw@wou.edu](mailto:cannodw@wou.edu)

Charles Lowney, **Board Treasurer**  
Department of Philosophy  
Washington and Lee University  
Lexington, VA 24450  
[lowneyc@wlu.edu](mailto:lowneyc@wlu.edu)

Gus Breyspraak  
Ottawa University  
4370 W. 109th Street Suite 200  
Overland Park, KS 66211  
[gus.breyspraak@ottawa.edu](mailto:gus.breyspraak@ottawa.edu)

Andrew Grosso  
Trinity Episcopal Church  
300 S Fifth St.  
Atchison, KS 66002  
[rector@trinityks.org](mailto:rector@trinityks.org)

Walter Mead  
4 Kenyon Court  
Bloomington, IL 61701-3320  
[wbmead@ilstu.edu](mailto:wbmead@ilstu.edu)

David Nikkel  
Dept. Philosophy & Religion  
UNC, Pembroke  
Pembroke, NC 28372  
[david.nikkel@uncp.edu](mailto:david.nikkel@uncp.edu)

Phil Rolnick  
University of St. Thomas  
2115 Summit Avenue  
Saint Paul, Minnesota 55105  
[parolnick@stthomas.edu](mailto:parolnick@stthomas.edu)

Zhenhua Yu  
Department of Philosophy  
East China Normal University  
3663 North Zhongshan Rd.  
Shanghai 200062, China  
[ecnyu@hotmail.com](mailto:ecnyu@hotmail.com)

Editor Emeritus  
Phil Mullins  
Missouri Western State University  
St. Joseph, MO 64507  
(816)244-2612  
[mullins@missouriwestern.edu](mailto:mullins@missouriwestern.edu)

Book Review Editor  
Walter Gulick  
Montana State University--Billings  
Billings, MT 59101  
(406) 259-3622  
[WGulick@msubillings.edu](mailto:WGulick@msubillings.edu)

## Preface

At the November 16, 2012 Polanyi Society Board meeting, Paul Lewis was officially appointed the new editor of TAD. We have been working on this transition for some time. The production and mailing of the paper copies of TAD will move to Mercer University next summer. I will remain engaged with TAD but in the capacity of editor emeritus. Thanks go to the many people who I have worked with on articles or other material going into TAD over the last 21 years that I have edited the journal. Particular thanks go to Walt Gulick, who has worked on TAD as long as I have, and to Paul Lewis, who also has labored many years.

Phil Mullins

I confess that it is with some trepidation that I step into this role as TAD editor. Phil has set high standards during his long service to the Society as editor (and much more). Moreover, it is humbling to take over from my undergraduate mentor. Who knew when I took a course on modern religious thought during my senior year many years ago that I would end up here!

My main goal as incoming editor is to indwell the tradition of excellence that this journal has come to represent, at the same time realizing that we likely will need to break out of some past practices in response to the emerging realities of academic journal publishing. In doing so, I will rely on Phil and Walt for their wise counsel, as well as members of the Polanyi Society Board. The Board has authorized me to put together an editorial board for TAD, so some of you will soon be hearing from me—or if you would like to serve on an editorial board, I will certainly consider volunteers!

In the meantime, business continues as usual. This issue features a symposium on Tihamér Margitay's essay from *Knowing and Being: Perspectives on the Philosophy of Michael Polanyi*, "From Epistemology to Ontology: Polanyi's Arguments for the Layered Ontology" (see Phil's introduction on p. 9) and reviews.

Paul Lewis

*Tradition & Discovery* is indexed selectively in *The Philosopher's Index* and *Religious and Theological Abstracts* and is included in the EBSCO online database of academic and research journals. *Tradition & Discovery* is listed in the Directory of Open Access Journals and is available online at [polanyi-society.org](http://polanyi-society.org).

---

# NEWS AND NOTES

---

## Dues Payment and Address Changes

The Oct. and Feb. but not the July issue of *TAD* include a membership flyer and an addressed envelope to be used to mail annual academic year dues and/or to make donations to the Polanyi Society. US postage regulations require that **EVERY** copy of *TAD* mailed in the postage class used must weigh exactly the same. Thus, even if you pay your annual dues in October, you will, nevertheless, receive these membership materials in your February copy of *TAD*. Dues remain \$35 (\$25 for libraries and \$15 students), a bargain in the academic journal world. Except for those residing outside the US, members should pay dues with a check. The Society can no longer easily and inexpensively process credit cards. For those living outside of the U.S., there is a Pay Pal payment option on the Polanyi Society membership web page (<http://polanysisociety.net/register/join-renew.php>). Dues and donations are handled by the Polanyi Society Treasurer, Charles Lowney (Dept. of Philosophy, Baker Hall 213, Washington and Lee University, Lexington, VA 24450 USA). Paul Lewis ([LEWIS\\_PA@mercer.edu](mailto:LEWIS_PA@mercer.edu)) should be contacted directly for *TAD* address changes.

## Recent Publications and Awards

**David Nikkel**, who recently joined the Polanyi Society Board of Directors, received the University of North Carolina Board of Governors' Award for Excellence in Teaching for the University of North Carolina--Pembroke for 2012. This is the highest award granted by the UNC System and comes with a stipend and medallion.

**David W. Agler**, who recently received his Ph. D. and currently is a lecturer in Philosophy at The Pennsylvania State University, recently published *Symbolic Logic: Syntax, Semantics, and Proof* (Rowman & Littlefield, 2012).

## Electronic Discussion List

The Polanyi Society supports an electronic discussion group that explores implications of the thought

of Michael Polanyi. Anyone interested can join. To join yourself, go to the following address: [http://groups.yahoo.com/group/polanyi\\_list/join](http://groups.yahoo.com/group/polanyi_list/join). If you have difficulty, send an e-mail to James van Pelt ([james.vanpelt@yale.edu](mailto:james.vanpelt@yale.edu)) and someone will see that you are added to the list.

## 2013 Society Annual Meeting Call for Papers

The annual meeting for the Polanyi Society in 2013 is tentatively scheduled for November 23, 2013 in Baltimore. Two Saturday sessions (each with slots for two papers plus responses) will be held in conjunction with the American Academy of Religion annual meeting.

Proposals are invited on any topic related to the ideas of Michael Polanyi and the subsequent development of Polanyi-influenced thought. Proposals (250-300 words) are due April 15, 2013 and should be sent as attachments to Walter Gulick, Program Chair ([wgulick@msubillings.edu](mailto:wgulick@msubillings.edu)). The following topics have been suggested:

- A session on Polanyian conceptions of the person in relation to contemporary views such as those of Christian Smith's *What Is a Person?*
- Polanyian ideas that ought to influence social theory today.
- Polanyi and biosemiotics—Polanyi's philosophy in relation to the thought of Deacon, Hoffmeyer, etc., and this new semiotic approach to the life sciences.
- Responses to recent themes/articles in *Tradition and Discovery*: e.g., the relation of epistemology and ontology, Polanyi and Peirce, Nye on Polanyi and social construction in history and philosophy of science, Jardine's political theory, etc.
- Tradition and the place of identity politics vs. individualistic rationalism in politics.

- Charles Taylor and Michael Polanyi: convergences and divergences.

- Assessing on a comparative basis how well Polanyi's thought about religion and meaning accords with the variety of theological work in recent decades:

- a) investigating theological writing of figures like Colin Gunton and Jeremy Begbie (figures who make use of Polanyi but have not been treated in an annual meeting). Or reflecting comparatively upon the work of these figures and/or other Polanyi-influenced theological writing such as that of Allen, Moleski, Meek, McCoy, Clark, Grosso, Apczynski, Nikkels, and Gelwick.

- b) examining how Polanyian thought relates to other recent or contemporary religious thinkers such as Oliver O'Donovan, Rosemary Ruether, Harvey Cox, Jean-Luc Marion, Sallie McFague, Stanley Hauerwas, Alistair McGrath, Cornel West, Fergus Kerr, Robert Jenson, David Tracy, N. T. Wright, John Cobb, Rowen Williams, Miroslav Volf, Ivona Gebara and/or Wesley Wildman.

## Polanyi Society Speakers Bureau

The Polanyi Society's Speakers Bureau helps organize talks to groups by Polanyi scholars. If you know anyone who might be interested in a speaker, send the name and e-mail address to Phil Mullins ([mullins@missouriwestern.edu](mailto:mullins@missouriwestern.edu)). There is now a link on the Polanyi Society web page with general information about the Speakers Bureau. You will find there a précis of the talks given by Marty Moleski S.J. and Richard Gelwick. Several Society members have indicated interest in speaking on different aspects of Polanyi's thought. It is likely that the Society can arrange for someone nearby to provide a talk on a topic of interest.

## Travel Assistance For Younger Scholars Attending Polanyi Society Annual Meeting

For students and other young scholars planning to attend the Polanyi Society Annual Meeting in Baltimore in November 2013 limited travel funding is available. Society members are urged to inform

worthy candidates about this assistance. Candidates and anyone who want to nominate a potential candidate, should contact Walter Mead ([wbmead@ilstu.edu](mailto:wbmead@ilstu.edu)) who administers the travel fund.

Contributions to the travel fund are, of course, always welcome. Those who wish to contribute should e-mail Walter Mead. Send checks directly to Charles Lowney, the Polanyi Society Treasurer (Department of Philosophy, Baker Hall 213, Washington and Lee University, Lexington, VA 24450). Donations can also be made using the link for the Pay Pal Donation Form on the membership page on the Polanyi Society web site (<http://polanyisociety.net/register/join-renew.php>). All donations are eligible for an IRS letter certifying a charitable deduction. Related information about travel funds is available on the Polanyi Society web site ([polanyisociety.org](http://polanyisociety.org)).

## WWW Polanyi Resources

The Polanyi Society web site ([polanyisociety.org/](http://polanyisociety.org/) or [polanyisociety.com/](http://polanyisociety.com/)) provides information about Polanyi Society membership and meetings. The site also contains the following: (1) digital archives containing all issues of *Tradition and Discovery* and its predecessor publications of the Polanyi Society going back to 1972; (2) indices listing *Tradition and Discovery* authors, reviews and reviewers; (3) the history of Polanyi Society publications; (4) information on *Appraisal* and *Polanyiana*, two sister journals with special interest in Michael Polanyi's thought; (5) a link to the "Guide to the Papers of Michael Polanyi," which provides an orientation to archival material housed in the Special Collections Research Center of the University of Chicago Library, Chicago, IL 60637; (6) photographs of Polanyi; (7) links to a number of Polanyi essays (available on the Polanyi Society web site and other sites), Polanyi's Duke Lectures (1964), as well as audio files for Polanyi's McEnerney Lectures (1962), and Polanyi's conversation with Carl Rogers (1966).

# Polanyi Society Board Minutes

8:30 PM, November 16, 2012  
Baumgarten Hall, Loyola University

Present: David Rutledge, Gus Breytspraak, Diane Yeager, Andrew Grosso, Phil Rolnick, Charles Lowney, Dale Cannon, Walter Mead, Martin Molesky, Walter Gulick, and Phil Mullins.

- President David Rutledge called the meeting to order at 8:25 PM.
- The Minutes of the November 2011 meeting were approved as submitted.
- Charles presented the Treasurer's Report in the form of a handout. We have about \$10,000 in our account. He noted that the interest in our Endowment account of 0.4% is a problem we should address. A motion was passed to restore the Travel Account to its prior level from the general fund, after travel expenditures for the June 2012 Chicago conference. We discussed moving a portion of the current balance to the Endowment Fund, and locating the Fund in a different place in order to keep up with inflation. The Society has received several gifts in response to the end-of-the-year challenge grant noted in the TAD 39:1 (Oct. 2012); one was a \$1000 stock donation which Treasurer Charles Lowney is currently deciding how to add to the Endowment Fund. The Treasurer's Report was accepted.
- David announced that Esther Meek and Tony Clark (now moved to Scotland) have completed their terms as Board members and will need replacement. He went on to say that David Nikkel has agreed to come on to the Board. He would be Esther's replacement and next year would be the first year of his three year term. Esther will need to wait two years before she is eligible for another term. Our By Laws require that we have 5 to 11 Board members. It is not essential that we replace Tony at this time. If another person were elected, she/he could begin by filling out the last two years of Tony's third term and thereby not disturb the rotation pattern. Diane suggested that it would be good to have a new person who would have a primary role in planning the next Polanyi Conference. Andrew expressed interest in helping plan the next Polanyi Conference. It was decided to have the Nominating Committee review the cycle of Board membership and come up with new names for next year. David Nikkel was accepted as a new member of the Board. Charles Lowney was accepted as a Board member to commence serving his second term and Zhenhua Yu to commence serving his third term.
- Gus summarized the Subcommittee Report on the transition to a new TAD Editor that had been sent out in advance (with extra copies at the meeting). The Subcommittee recommended that Phil become Editor Emeritus and that Paul Lewis become the Editor, and that TAD be moved to Mercer University. Mercer has tentatively agreed to work out ways modestly to subsidize some TAD expenses such as mailing. The Subcommittee recommended that the print version of TAD be continued until postal costs make it impossible. The Subcommittee Report was accepted. Wally Mead suggested that donors be solicited to continue the printed version if it is needed. Diane initiated a discussion by asking, "What are our dues for? We need to come up with a clearer answer. Are they effectively 'solicited donations'? An electronic copy still costs money." Dues clearly support the activities of the Polanyi Society. What might we do besides produce a journal? Extra donations recently have gone to the Travel Fund. Might we have an Essay Contest? A Polanyi Prize? Put syllabii up on the website? James Van Pelt has suggested that we create an electronic course on Polanyi through the website. Dale suggested that we do a thoughtful review of

the website to make it more of a teaching device, and presented a motion to create an ad hoc committee to review the website for teaching purposes, with links to the parallel European societies.

- Phil next presented the TAD Report (by way of a handout and summary). Diane suggested that we coordinate our fiscal year with that of Mercer University. A motion to empower Paul Lewis to appoint an Editorial Committee was passed. Diane suggested that we carefully monitor subscription costs for persons outside of the US. A discussion ensued about options other than keeping TAD an open access journal. There are pros and cons with any of these options. One reason we might consider JSTOR or MUSE is that many researchers do not these days look elsewhere. Resources identified by databases and resource aggregators are the first choice in today's scholarly academic world. Phil pointed out that the contracts with such groups (e.g., JSTOR and MUSE) are various, but that it is likely almost all contracts would require that TAD no longer be an "open source" journal available free on the web and listed in the Open Source Directory. The Open Source Directory is increasingly used by academic librarians since there is a war going on between (1) those increasingly fewer operations publishing increasingly pricey academic journals and (2) open source publishing. Academic libraries are caught in the war zone and some seem to be supporting the open source publication movement. Phil also pointed out that although some aggregators/databases like JSTOR do make search and retrieval easy, there are other things to be aware of. Some schools/academic libraries cannot afford JSTOR. Even if an academic library has a subscription, there is no assurance that it will automatically include TAD because different types/levels of subscription include different packages of journals. This sort of multi-level subscription option also is more or less true of the databases like EBSCO that TAD currently is included in. Some subscription packages seem to provide subscribers with full text of TAD and some apparently do not. Some index a few years and others index a broader range of years. Phil also pointed out that to be included in something like JSTOR one must apply and be evaluated for "fittingness" or "desirability." In Phil's previous applications for inclusion in JSTOR, he believes that the most significant question for JSTOR applicants was "How many libraries now subscribe to the journal?" This question provides JSTOR with some indication about how "desirable" (from a JSTOR perspective) it might be to include a journal in one of their subscription options. JSTOR and other databases are businesses and they wish primarily to include journals already in libraries since libraries can save space and dollars on individual subscriptions for such journals, labor, etc. and thus libraries who have ample budgets will opt to subscribe to JSTOR. JSTOR, in Phil's view, has little motive to include small subscription, specialized, limited circulation journals like TAD. Someone suggested that we ask our university/college librarians to include TAD as one of the open access journals they list. That is, if there is a local library list of open access journals, TAD should be added to it. In sum, the Board will follow the Subcommittee's recommendation that for the present we stay the current course of continuing to publish a print journal at Mercer which we distribute independently and that we continue to produce an open-access, identical version for the web. Phil emphasized the continuing need to regularly re-evaluate TAD options; this requires continual monitoring of the changing electronic publishing landscape and options like JSTOR and MUSE.
- Marty reported on the June Loyola Conference, going over the highlights of his written report. Phil stated that next time the Treasurer should be in the middle of Conference planning as we did this year. It was recommended that 2016 be the next Conference. Kudos to Marty, and Phil also, for their many, many roles in making the Conference a success, and to Marty for such a helpful report. It was proposed that we appoint a group no later than next year and perhaps right away to begin setting up the 2016 Conference. Charles, as Treasurer, agreed to be part of the planning.



- Wally next presented the Travel Fund Report, which was accepted after a brief discussion.
- Dale went over the current state of planning for the William H. Poteat Conference to take place June 6, 7, and 8, 2014 at Yale Divinity School. James van Pelt, on the staff of Yale Divinity School, will be setting up the Conference. It was suggested that donations be solicited well in advance, because Yale Divinity School will be requiring an advance payment, likely \$1500 to \$2500. Such donations can be funneled through the Polanyi Society, as it is a 501C3 charitable institution with the IRS. This will be better than going through Yale. The question of liability was raised, for unexpected expenses and losses. This could be handled by having the Polanyi Society be the official sponsor of the Conference. It was suggested that Dale look carefully into James' situation at YDS. A contract with YDS will need to be signed well in advance to lock in prices and will not be contingent upon James being there. The possibility of a sculpture by Evangelos Moustakas in honor of Poteat was brought up. It was suggested that that project not be closely tied to the Conference itself. Lots of "potholes" were brought up that will need to be steered around. Dale was instructed to get a formal proposal to the Polanyi Society Board as soon as possible, with rough costs, including an honorarium for Bruce Lawrence, a colleague and friend of Bill Poteat, who will be giving the opening plenary. It will then be sent around to Board members via email for discussion and action.
- Walt Gulick reported on the current state of the Polanyi Reader. He has not had time until recently to work on it. He went to the University of Chicago Press today. They said that they would like for him to have all copyright releases in hand. Next semester Walt will not be teaching and the Reader is his next priority. The Reader is/will be the only comprehensive source on Polanyi. He would like to obtain a clearer response from the University of Chicago Press than he has currently received. They have not been easy to deal with. Wally will give Walt the name of the person who handled the recent republication of *The Tacit Dimension*. Additional suggestions were made: (1) consider the earlier offer from Templeton Press for a subvention; (2) consider self-publication, if nothing else becomes viable; (3) consider web-publication—e.g., in connection with an on-line course on Polanyi at the Polanyi website.

Respectfully submitted,  
Dale Cannon, Secretary

## Treasurer's Report

On page 8 is a spread sheet covering the Society's most recent fiscal year. Travel Fund grants for the Loyola conference were mostly handled via conference fee reductions and via paying for the guest rooms of the grantees. In the few cases that cash was issued to cover further travel expenses, the transfer of donations was handled through the general account and did not pass through the travel fund account. Thank you to the generous donors who helped to keep us in the black.

Respectfully submitted,  
Charles Lowney, Treasurer

Polanyi Society Treasurer's Report - Fiscal Year Sept 1, 2011 – August 31, 2012					
<b>General Fund:</b>					
	<b>Opening balance 9/1/11:</b>				<b>\$ 4,986.52</b>
	<b>Revenue:</b>				<b>\$ 25,234.34</b>
	dues:			\$ 3,457.00	
	loyola revenue (minus refunds):			\$ 14,984.85	
	donations to any			\$ 2,683.00	
	donations for Endowment:			\$ 1,395.00	
	donations for loyola:			\$ 1,414.15	
	donations for travel fund:			\$ 1,250.00	
	misc			\$ 50.34	
	<b>Transfers out:</b>				<b>\$ 3,523.80</b>
	To endowment fund (11/12):			\$ 1,395.00	
	To travel fund grant recipients (by check):			\$ 528.80	
	To TAD Account			\$ 1,600.00	
	<b>Expenditures:</b>				<b>\$ 16,012.07</b>
	To Loyola (for Conference)			12,981.75	
	bank & Paypal fees			\$ 76.75	
	other expenses			\$ 492.40	
	Honoraria			\$ 2,461.17	
	<b>Balance 8/31/12:</b>				<b>\$ 10,684.99</b>
<b>Travel Fund :</b>					
	<b>Opening balance 9/1/11:</b>				<b>\$ 1,074.69</b>
	<b>Revenue:</b>				<b>\$ 2.92</b>
	interest:			\$2.92	
	<b>Balance 8/31/12:</b>				<b>\$ 1,077.61</b>
<b>TAD account (at Missouri Western):</b>					
	<b>Opening balance 9/1/11:</b>				<b>\$ 846.33</b>
	<b>Revenue: 9/1/11-8/31/12</b>				<b>\$ 1,985.08</b>
	Transfers from General Account:			\$ 1,600.00	
	credit card pd dues or donations			\$ 370.00	
	misc adjustment			\$ 15.08	
	<b>Expenditures:</b>				<b>\$ 2,631.46</b>
	printing			\$ 1,632.05	
	postage			\$ 999.41	
	<b>Ending Balance 8/31/12:</b>				<b>\$ 199.95</b>
<b>Endowment Fund:</b>					
	<b>Opening balance 9/1/11:</b>				<b>\$ 9,950.24</b>
	Donations :			\$ 1,395.00	
	Interest: (currently .4 AYP)			\$ 57.80	
	<b>Ending Balance 8/31/12</b>				<b>\$ 11,403.04</b>