Tradition & Discovery The Polanyi Society Periodical

Volume XXXVIII	Number 2	20112012
Preface		
Update on June 8-10, 2012 Po	olanyi Society Loyola, Chicago Con	ference6
An Open Letter Soliciting F	inancial Support For The Polanyi	Society7
June 8-10, 2012 Loyola Con	nference—Final Call for Papers	8
	al Meeting Call for Papers	
Mary Jo Nye's Michael Po	lanyi and His Generation: Origins	of the Social Construc-
tion	of Science: Analyses and Respons	e
"Michael Polanyi and the So	ocial Studies of Science" by Theodo	re L. Brown10
· ·	L	
"The Personal and the Para	digmatic"by Richard Henry Schr	nitt15
"A Response to Theodore L.	Brown and Richard Henry Schmitt	"by Mary Jo Nye21
	rcia Narvaez	
"Polanyi and Narvaez's 'M	oral Rationality" by Gus Breytsp	oraak34
Notes on Contributors	•••••	39
"Toward a Holistic Moral F	Rationality" by Paul Lewis	40
"Restoring Personal Knowl	ledge and Virtue: Response to Cor	mmentary"44
	by Darcia Narvaez	
· ·	•••••	
"In Defense of Polanyi's Und	erstanding of Evolution: A Respons by Daniel Paksi	se to Walter Gulick"48
"On the Adequacy of Neo-D	Parwinism: A Reply to Daniel Paks	i" by Walter Gulick56
"Michael Polanyi and Karl F	Popper: The Fraying of a Long-Star	ndingAcquaintance"61
by	Struan Jacobs and Phil Mullins	
Reviews		94
Hubert Dreyfus and Sean	Dorrance Kelly, All Things Shining: Red	ading Western Classics
	to Find Meaning in a Secular Age	
Robert M. Geraci. Anaca	James M. Okapal lyptic AI: Visions of Heaven in Robotics, A	Artificial Intelligence
Robert III. Geraei, Apoeu	and Virtual Reality	ingeminengence,
	Bob Doede	

The Polanyi Society

General Editor-Tradition & Discovery Phil Mullins Missouri Western State University St. Joseph, MO 64507 (816)244-2612 FAX (816)271-5987 mullins@missouriwestern.edu

David Rutledge, Board President Department of Religion Furman University Greenville, SC 29613-6298 David.Rutledge@furman.edu

Diane Yeager, Board Vice President Theology Department Georgetown Univeristy 37th and O Streets, NW Washington, DC 20057 yeagerd@georgetown.edu

Dale Cannon, **Board Secretary** Division of Humanities Western Oregon University Monmouth, OR 97361 USA **cannodw@wou.edu**

Charles Lowney, **Board Treasurer** Department of Philosophy Washington and Lee University Lexington, VA 24450 **lowneyc@wlu.edu**

Gus Breytspraak Ottawa University 4370 W. 109th Street Suite 200 Overland Park, KS 66211 gus.breytspraak@ottawa.edu

Andrew Grosso Trinity Episcopal Church 300 S Fifth St. Atchison, KS 66002 rector@trinityks.org

Walter Mead 4 Kenyon Court Bloomington, IL 61701-3320 wbmead@comcast.net

Esther Meek Geneva College Beaver Falls, PA 15010 longingtoknow@gmail.com

Phil Rolnick University of St. Thomas 2115 Summit Avenue Saint Paul, Minnesota 55105 parolnick@stthomas.edu

ZhenhuaYu Department of Philosophy East China Normal University 3663 North Zhongshan Rd. Shanghai 200062, China ecnuyu@hotmail.com

Tony Clark
Department of Religion and Humanities
Friends University
2100 W. University St.
Wichita, KS 67213
clarkto@friends.edu

Associate Editor Paul Lewis Mercer University Macon, GA 31207 (478) 301-4166 lewis pa@mercer.edu Book Review Editor Walter Gulick Montana State University--Billings Billings, MT 59101 (406) 259-3622 WGulick@msubillings.edu

Preface

This issue is the last before the June 8-10 Loyola Conference; included is the final call for papers and an update on the program, as well as the call for papers for the November 2012 annual meeting. It is not too late to make a Loyola paper proposal but the deadline is approaching. The Society is still seeking donations to support scholarships for this conference. As in past February issues, there is the annual financial report and the minutes on the annual meeting of the Board. The bottom line is the Society is solvent and the Board is organizing to address several important issues that lie before us in the near future.

Mary Jo Nye's *Michael Polanyi and His Generation: Origins of the Social Construction of Science* came out last October. Ted Brown and Dick Schmitt have review essays on this interesting new book and Mary Jo Nye kindly provided a response to Brown and Schmitt.

Darcia Narvez, a psychologist, was invited to give a paper at the November 2011 annual meeting; Gus Breytspraak and Paul Lewis responded to this paper. These materials provoked a lively discussion in San Francisco; they are included in *TAD* 38:2, along with a final word of response from Narvaez.

Daniel Paksi, a young Hungarian Polanyi scholar, raises issues concerned with Polanyi's discussion of evolution and emergence; Paksi's essay challenges the criticisms that Walter Gulick and others have offered (in *TAD* and other journals) of Polanyi's account. I invited Gulick to respond to Paksi in this issue.

Finally, there is an essay on Polanyi and Karl Popper that Struan Jacobs and I wrote. The essay digs into little-known archival correspondence and closely examines some Polanyi publications and lectures from the early fifties, the period when Polanyi first made clear his differences with Popper. Also you will find two book reviews this round, one covering a widely reviewed and criticized popular book by two prominent philosophers.

Phil Mullins

Tradition & Discovery is indexed selectively in *The Philosopher's Index* and *Religious and Theological Abstracts* and is included in the EBSCO online database of academic and research journals.

NEWS AND NOTES

A Note on Dues Payment

The Oct. and Feb. issues of TAD include a membership flyer and an addressed envelope to be used to mail annual academic year dues and/or to make donations to the Polanyi Society. US postage regulations require that **EVERY** copy of *TAD* mailed in the postage class used must weigh exactly the same. Thus, even if you have already paid your annual dues, you will receive these membership materials in your copy of TAD. Dues remain \$35 (\$25 for libraries and \$15 students), a bargain in the academic journal world. Except for those residing outside the US, members should pay dues with a check. The Society can no longer easily and inexpensively process credit cards. We are presently setting up a Pay Pal payment option on the Polanyi Society web page. Until the Pay Pal option is operational, subscribers unable to pay dues with a check in US dollars, should contact Phil Mullins. Note that dues and donations are handled by the Polanyi Society Treasurer, Charles Lowney, whose address is on the enclosed envelope; Phil Mullins should be contacted directly for TAD address changes (contact information is on the inside of the cover).

Minutes of Board Meeting November 18, 2011

Present: Voting Members: Wally Mead, Phil Rolnick, David Rutledge, Diane Yeager, Andrew Grosso, Gus Breytspraak, Dale Cannon, Esther Meek, and Charles Lowney (arrived late). Non-Voting Members: Phil Mullins, Jere Moorman, Marty Moleski, Walt Gulick (arrived late).

- 1. President David Rutledge called the meeting to order at the Daily Grill Restaurant at approximately 8:15 PM.
- 2. The Minutes from the Board meeting in Atlanta of October 29, 2010, were approved as distributed.

- 3. The Treasurer's Report was postponed until Charles Lowney arrived (see item 11 below).
- 4. Report on TAD, sent out by Phil in advance.
 - The primary issue is whether or not we are going to continue to publish a paper journal or rather, when we will cease to do so. In the long term, we will have to shift entirely over to a digital journal. But for the immediate present, what we do is OK, though postage will soon raise the rate significantly. Dale proposed that a survey be taken of the current readership to find out preferences. Digital publishing of *TAD* in MUSE and in JSTOR is being explored.
 - As Phil Mullins is now retired from Missouri Western and no longer will be having the connections and privileges that he once had, Phil recommended that we need to create a committee (for perhaps a year) to oversee appointing a replacement to the current printing arrangement among other things. It is not as urgent to move the website (which likely can continue where it is for the immediately foreseeable future and, if so, would work well for Phil) as it is to move the production of a paper journal. David, as president, agreed to appoint a small committee to work with Phil to take on this task and insure an orderly transition.
 - In any case, if and when we cease to produce a paper *TAD*, we need to give ample notice to subscribers and have it end on a July issue, the last of our annual cycle

5 Miscellaneous:

- Andrew suggested that the U of Chicago be approached with a proposal to have the Polanyi archives digitized. Phil commented that this would be a BIG project and probably we would need a big grant to pursue it.
- Marty added that the original Scott manuscript of the Polanyi biography is on disk and available for whoever requests it.
- Phil said that the "center of gravity" in Polanyi Studies has moved to Hungary and a new generation of students and scholars has emerged there in

connection with MPLPA (The Michael Polanyi Liberal Philosophical Association). We probably should try to work closely with them.

- Marty reported that John Polanyi has said that he plans to donate Michael Polanyi's letters and other papers that have never been accessible to the public to the University of Toronto Library.
- David reported an interest on the part of the Thomas Torrance Society in having a joint meeting on Polanyi and Torrance in celebration of his 100th Birthday anniversary.

6. Next Year's Plans:

- It was noted that the AAR Program this year has next to nothing in it about our (Polanyi Society) program this year. Several responded that it is important to get this exposure, even given the cost. The Endowment Committee was asked to take this up.
- Relating to the earlier discussion about *TAD* going all digital, the comment was made that *TAD's* counterpart in England, *Appraisal*, has a subscription-only access to new issues and to their archive of old issues. Their subscription list, compared to *TAD*, apparently has relatively few members. Marty suggested that we consider a subscription-only access, but Phil commented that this move would have some liabilities.
- We will need about \$2000 for next year's program at the Chicago AAR. In response to this announcement, Jere and Wally each pledged \$500 and Phil Rolnick pledged \$25.

7. Need for a Membership Secretary

• It was suggested that we have need of a membership secretary to alleviate some of the responsibility that Phil has been carrying. But we have up to now had little systematic record keeping of membership. Phil proposed that we hold off for a year from appointing a membership secretary, for Charles may be able to handle it without much additional work.

8. 2012 Loyola Polanyi Conference:

- Phil, Marty, Gus, and David are the Conference Planning Group.
- Costs were discussed, which have reduced significantly since the 2008 Conference, partly

because we will be meeting at the downtown Loyola campus. The proposed Registration Fee is \$185.00, which will include the Banquet.

- It looks like we will be able to cover expenses with our current budget trajectory.
- We plan to make contacts with the 2008 Conference attendees, the graduate [and undergraduate] students that attended our Meeting last year, and possibly contact relevant academic departments and graduate programs. Some volunteers may be needed to help with the emailing and/or phoning.
- It was suggested that the Endowment Committee work at trying to stimulate extra donations for the Loyola Conference. It meets tomorrow morning (Saturday 11/19) at Max's Deli at 7:30 am.

9. Travel Fund:

• Wally reported that the Travel Fund was not depleted at all this year. We have a little more than \$1100 available. He said we should double that amount.

10. Polanyi Reader:

• Walt Gulick arrived about 10 pm. He reported that the Reader has been done for 2 years, but he confessed apologetically that not much has been done in terms of follow up recently, but, possibly with some help from Dale and others, some progress should be made.

11. Treasurer's Report

- Charles arrived about 10:10 pm. He gave a quick version of the Treasurer's Report.
- At the end of the fiscal year (8/31/11) the General Fund had \$4,986.52; Travel Fund, \$1,074.69; *TAD*, \$846.33; and Endowment, \$9.950.24.
- The Report was accepted unanimously by voice vote.

12. Poteat Papers Archive

• Wally reported that the Poteat Papers have been sent to the Yale Divinity School Library and are presently being processed for archiving. There are currently about 3000 pages, including a large amount of correspondence (perhaps 40 %). What was on audio tape has been transcribed to CDs.

More is expected to be sent to the collection.

13. We adjourned about 10:25 pm.

Dale Cannon, Secretary

Polanyi Society Treasurer's Report Fiscal Year Sept 1, 2010 – August 31, 2011

General Fund:	9 ,		
Opening balance 9/1/10:	\$4,641.52		
Revenue:	\$4,570.00		
Transfers from <i>TAD</i> acct:	\$4,000.00		
Dues & donations:	\$ 570.00		
Transfers out:	(\$2,660.00)		
To travel fund:	\$ 922.50		
To endowment fund:	\$1,737.50		
Expenditures:	(\$1,565.00)		
(includes \$1,390 Loyola Deposit			
Ending balance 8/31/11:	\$4,986.52		
. 8	, , ,		
TAD Account (at Missouri Western	<u>n):</u>		
Opening balance 9/1/10:	\$1,429.04		
Revenue(dues & donations):	\$5,827.60		
Expenditures:	(\$3,127.87)		
Printing:	\$1,319.75		
Postage:	\$ 944.37		
Supplies:	\$ 80.69		
Bank Charges:	\$ 65.50		
Transfers to General Account:	(\$4,000.00)		
Ending balance 8/31/11:	\$846.33		
<u>Travel Fund:</u>			
Opening balance 9/1/10:	\$350.00		
Revenue:	\$1,024.21		
Direct donations:	\$ 100.00		
Transfers in from genl acct:	\$ 922.50		
Interest:	\$ 1.71		
Outlays:	(\$ 300.00)		
Returned Outlay:	(\$ 300.00)		
Outlays:	\$600.00		
Ending balance 8/31/11:	\$1,074.69		
Endowment Fund:			
Opening balance 9/1/10:	\$8,167.66		

Donations (transferred from Genl Acct): \$1,737.50

Ending balance 8/31/11:

Interest:

Overview of Genera	al, <i>TAD</i> , a	and Travel	Accts:	
Opening balances	9/1/10:		\$6,421.0)4
Revenue (dues		interest).	\$6 499	3

Total Expenditures: (\$4,275.31)

<u>Transfers to Endowment Fund:</u> (\$1,737.50)

Ending balances 8/31/11: \$6,907.54

Charles Lowney, Treasurer

Travel Assistance Available For Younger Scholars Attending Polanyi Society Meetings

For students and other young scholars planning to attend the June 8-10, 2012 Loyola Conference or the November 2012 Annual Meeting in Chicago, limited travel funding is available. Society members are urged to inform worthy candidates about this assistance Those interested in this funding, as well as those who know of potential candidates, should contact Walter Mead (wbmead@ilstu.edu). Contributions to the travel fund are always welcome; those interested in contributing should e-mail Walter Mead. Related information about travel funds can also be found on the Polanyi Society web site.

Polanyi Society Speakers Bureau

The Polanyi Society's Speakers Bureau helps organize talks to groups by Polanyi scholars. Marty Moleski, S. J. and Richard Gelwick gave talks in 2010 at universities; Richard Moodey and Phil Mullins gave talks in summer of 2011 at a meeting in Gummersbach, Germany. If you know anyone who might be interested in a speaker, send the name and e-mail address to Phil Mullins (mullins@missouriwestern.edu). There is now a link on the Polanyi Society web page with general information about the Speakers Bureau. You will find there a précis of the talks given by Moleski and Gelwick. Several Society members have indicated interest in speaking on different aspects of Polanyi's thought. It is likely that the Society can arrange for someone nearby to provide a talk on a topic of interest.

\$45.08

\$9,950.24

Update on Polanyi Society Loyola Conference

The Polanyi Society conference that is scheduled for June 8-10, 2012 at Loyola University, Chicago, is taking shape. The conference will be held at the downtown Loyola conference center which is easily accessible by public transportation. This site is much like the Loyola conference center at which the 2008 Polanyi Society conference was held. Registration is online and is now open; some details about food options are still being negotiated but the registration form is on the Polanyi Society web site (http://www.missouriwestern.edu/orgs/polanyi/ or simply polanyisociety.org/). Some travel assistance/conference registration scholarships will be available for students and/or younger scholars (see the notice elsewhere in this issue as well as Society President David Rutledge's open letter which seeks fund donations for the travel fund and other Loyola expenses).

Some plenary sessions for the Loyola conference are now set and possibilities for other sessions are being explored. Mary Jo Nye, Horning Professor in the Humanities and Professor of History Emeritus at Oregon State University, will give a talk on Friday evening June 8. Nye is a historian of chemistry with long-standing interest in (and many publications about) Michael Polanyi. Professor Nye received the History of Science Society's Sarton Medal for Lifetime Scholarly Achievement in 2006. Her new book, Michael Polanyi and His Generation: Origins of the Social Construction of Science (University of Chicago Press) is discussed (with a response from her) in two review articles in this issue of TAD. Walter Gulick, Professor Emeritus from Montana State University, Billings, will provide the Saturday, June 9 evening banquet address. Gulick had a long career at MSU, Billings, teaching in philosophy, religious studies and interdisciplinary humanities as well serving as a department chair, founding honors director and academic vice president. He was twice a Fulbright Scholar (once in Budapest where he worked on the then new journal of the MPLPA, Polanyiana). Gulick joined the Polanyi Society in 1972 at its inception and has been an important leader, serving as Society President, Board member and TAD review editor for twenty years. He has published more than thirty essays, review articles, and book reviews in TAD as well as many essays and reviews in other Polanyi-oriented journals such as Appraisal and Polanyiana and journals like Zygon. On Saturday afternoon, there will be a panel discussion focusing on issues in political philosophy. Panelists will be scholars whose writings about political theory/political philosophy makes use of Polanyi's work. It may be possible to set up one conference session in which one of Polanyi's "economics education" films made in the late thirties is shown and discussed by a panel of economists.

The 2012 Loyola conference, like the earlier conferences, will also include a number of concurrent sessions at which conference participants give papers. As of mid December, about 15 proposals have been submitted and other inquiries have been received; we anticipate that a full set of approximately 30 papers will come in before the deadline. Insofar as possible, papers will be grouped thematically. Sessions will be scheduled with ample time for discussion. The conference planning committee hopes for proposals covering a wide range of topics to which Polanyi's ideas can be related. See the call for papers elsewhere in this issue of *TAD*. This conference, like earlier Loyola conferences, will build in time for informal discussions among participants.

An Open Letter Soliciting Financial Support For The Polanyi Society

Dear TAD Reader,

Even a quick reading of the plans for the June 8-10, 2012 Polanyi Conference at Loyola University, Chicago outlined in this issue reveals the opportunities for scholarly enrichment this conference presents. Anyone who has attended these Loyola gatherings in the past knows how much more enjoyable they are than more typical, large academic meetings where you have to fight to access elevators or restaurants!

But the Chicago conference offers another, less visible, opportunity—a chance to support the Society's work tangibly by making a special gift to the Loyola effort. Many Society members contribute more than dues to the Society each year, and that faithfulness, as well as an extremely Spartan operation with minimal overhead, has enabled The Polanyi Society to be one of the more active scholarly groups around. Publishing this journal, maintaining a web site (with many scholarly resources) and an electronic discussion list, sponsoring annual meetings (with peer-reviewed papers and/or invited distinguished speakers) in conjunction with the American Academy of Religion and occasional meetings with the American Philosophical Society, supporting important publications (e.g., the Polanyi biography and the re-issue of *The Tacit Dimension*), establishing the William Poteat archive at Yale, setting up a travel fund to help young scholars attend Polanyi-related meetings—all of these efforts have depended upon the energy and financial support of a relatively small society.

The Loyola conference entails certain unavoidable expenses (e.g., renting meeting rooms), as well as costs that enhance the event: (covering expenses for some plenary speakers, registration and travel support for some younger scholars, organizing a trip to the Polanyi archives). As in the past, contributions to offset special conference expenses are something we must solicit and count on. Please send a check to the Treasurer, Dr. Charles Lowney, Dept. of Philosophy, Washington and Lee University, Lexington, VA 24450 (e-mail: lowneyc@wlu.edu).

As other earlier announcements in *TAD* indicated, another giving opportunity that exists is the new Polanyi Society Endowment Fund, which aims to establish more stable, long-term funding for the Society's activities. The endowment contains about \$10,000 at present, and we hope to double that amount in this next year. If you wish to know more about supporting the endowment (and that includes making a bequest), please contact me, since as the current Society president I chair the Endowment Committee (david.rutledge@furman.edu). Like last year, we had a challenge open until January 1, 2012 from endowment donors willing to match up to \$2000 received. We may be able to set up such a challenge later in 2012; if you are interested, send me a note. Send endowment donations (clearly marked as such) directly to Charles Lowney at the address above. Since the Polanyi Society is an IRS 501C3 organization, donations to the Loyola Conference and/or the endowment above the \$35 annual Society membership dues are tax deductible.

David Rutledge President, Polanyi Society

2012 Polanyi Society Conference

Connections/Disconnections: Polanyi and Contemporary Concerns and Domains of Inquiry

Call For Papers

The Polanyi Society will sponsor a three-day conference June 8-10, 2012. Conference participants will have the opportunity to spend a morning (June 8) at the Regenstein Library of the University of Chicago reviewing the archival Polanyi materials held there. The conference will include several plenary speakers or panels as well as parallel sessions in which conference participants present and discuss papers with others interested in the session's particular topic. Like the Polanyi Society sponsored conferences in 2001 and 2008, this will be a conference that builds in many opportunities for discussion and is open to persons using Polanyi-related ideas in a number of fields.

Proposals are invited for papers that examine the themes of post-critical thought in the context of the new century. The following are some suggested general categories within which specific papers might be grouped. [Please do not think of these categories as a limit for submissions but as a springboard for your own reflections. The final program will reflect groupings adjusted in light of proposals submitted.]

- · Polanyi As Public Intellectual: Cultural Criticism and Reorientation in the New Global Order
- · Redeeming Reason: Does "Personal Knowledge" Have a Future in a Partisan World?
- · Polanyi in the Light of Developments in Psychology (and vice versa)
- · Polanyi's Work in Relation to Current Accounts of Organizations, Institutions and Authority
- · Doubt and Commitment in the Postmodern Environment
- · Religion and Science: Polanyi and Current Discussions
- · History and Philosophy of Science: Polanyi and Current Discussions
- · Contemporary Politics and Economics in Polanyian Perspective (and vice versa)
- · Polanyi and the Rediscovery of Embodiment
- · Language, Learning and Logic—Polanyi and Current Discussions
- · Trust, Truth and Conscience: Polanyian Communal Values and Contemporary Culture
- · The Good Society: Polanyi and Current Challenges
- · Pluralism: Does Polanyi Help Us Address Current Interest in and Problems Associated with Diversity?
- · Can Polanyi Speak to a Digital Age?
- · Resources in Polanyi for Theological Reconstruction in the Face of Fanaticism and Secularism
- · Skills, Practice and Virtue—Polanyian Links
- · Polanyi on the Importance of the Beautiful
- · Polanyi's Antireductionism and the Logic of Emergence
- · Proposals for panel presentations are invited

Proposals should be 250-300 words and will be reviewed by a panel of jurors. Send an electronic copy of the proposal without your name on it as an attachment to Phil Mullins at **mullins@missouriwestern.edu**. In the body of the e-mail, provide a preferred mailing address (or fax number) as well a phone number of the author. The final deadline for proposals is March 30, 2012. If the proposal is for a panel, the full panel needs to be identified and one member designated as the primary contact. The panel proposal should outline why a discussion of this topic is important. Postings on the Polanyi Society web site (http://www.missouriwestern.edu/orgs/polanyi/ or polanyisociety/org) will include additional conference information.

2012 Polanyi Society Annual Meeting

Call for Papers

The annual meeting for the Polanyi Society for 2012 is projected to be November 17, 2012 in Chicago in conjunction with the American Academy of Religion annual meeting. There will be a morning and evening session on Saturday, November 17 with two papers and responses in each session.

We invite papers on the following topics:

- Explorations of Polanyi's ontology (Tihamér Margitay's recent writing reopens this question; see his essay, as well as others in *Knowing and Being: Perspectives on the Philosophy of Michael Polanyi*, reviewed in *TAD* 37:1.
- Because 2012 is the centennial year for Thomas Torrance, we welcome a presentation focusing on Torrance and Polanyi.
- A paper that follows up on "The Participatory Turn," the 2011 paper by Jake Sherman (based on a recent book) and response by Dale Cannon (on links with post-critical philosophy).
- A paper on moral psychology that follows up the discussion initiated by the 2011 paper by Darcia Narvaez.
- A paper on educational assessment and its "fit" with Polanyian ideas.
- A paper on Polanyi as a social theorist.
- A paper on the work of Scottish moral philosopher John Macmurray.
- A paper on the recent book by Mary Jo Nye, *Michael Polanyi and His Generation: Origins of the Social Construction of Science* (Chicago, 2011).

Proposals (or general inquiries) on these or any other topics are invited. Proposals (250-300 words) should be sent as an attachment to David Rutledge (<u>david.rutledge@furman.edu</u>) by April 1, 2012.