

NEWS AND NOTES

Tradition and Discovery 43:2

June 2017

The “News and Notes” section of *Tradition and Discovery* is available only online. It includes bibliographic information, calls for papers, annual meeting programs, and any other items possibly of interest to members of the Polanyi Society and others persons working with the thought of Michael Polanyi. Send material to Paul Lewis, Editor of *Tradition and Discovery* at lewis_pa@mercer.edu .

Appraisal: Journal of the British Personalist Forum takes a special interest in the thought of Michael Polanyi. The contents of the two most recent issues of *Appraisal* (vol.11, numbers 1 and 2) are listed below. Information about *Appraisal* is available is online: <http://www.britishpersonalistforum.org.uk/contents.html>.

Appraisal Vol. 11, No. 1 (Spring 2016).

Mihretu P. Guta, “Looking into Objects, Dispositions and the Lockean Person-Making Properties,” pp. 4-11.

Abstract: This paper examines certain influential contemporary philosophical analyses of the notion of a person and shows why they are misguided. Inspired by the Lockean conception of a person, some philosophers claim that personhood must be attributed only to those human beings who can meet certain criteria required for it. Here the views of Tooley, Dennett and Singer will be discussed against the backdrop of the metaphysics of *powers ontology* as advocated by contemporary philosophers: C. B. Martin, John Heil and others.

Key Words: Dispositions, manifestations, objects, personhood

Sam N. Johnson, “Mixed Modes and the Non-existence of Lockean Persons,” pp. 12-15.

Abstract: I argue that Lockean persons do not exist. Rather, they should be interpreted as mixed modes which are fundamental to the reification of moral concepts which themselves are fundamental to the reification of Lockean persons. The semantic content of a mixed mode derives from its constituent simple ideas, and Locke does not provide a

substantive account of what it means to exist as a person. “Person” then is devoid of semantic content because it refers to a mixed mode.

Key Words: Identity, Locke, mixed modes, persons, substance

M.B. Raehil, “On the Mistaken Lexical Liberty of Conflating Self and Person in Philosophy,” pp. 16-19.

Abstract: This paper argues that ‘self’ and ‘person’ should be understood as distinct terms that each carry their own set of unique problems. First, I will offer a definition of ‘self.’ Second, I will show how the terms ‘self’ and ‘person’ are often used interchangeably but do not always hold identical semantic value. I conclude by drawing two key distinctions and showing how each term should hold its own space within philosophical discourse.

Key Words: First-person perspective; Personal Identity; Psychological continuity; Self

Sari Kavilevsky, “Moral Personhood and Humans with Tails: Exploring the Bounds of the Moral,” pp. 20-25.

Abstract: I argue that attempts to explain the objective bindingness of morality by appeal to contingent facts about human nature renders the bounds of morality unsettlingly arbitrary. It provides no principled explanation for the bounds of morality and determinations of who deserves moral standing. This can lead to an expansion of the moral universe. But it fails to guard against drawing distinctions among human beings that are ordinarily thought to be morally repugnant.

Key Words: Persons, Personhood, Moral Standing, Metaethics, Moral Arbitrariness, Human Beings, Moral Anthropology

Cheongho Lee, “Pierce on Person: Peirce's Theory of Determination and the Existence of Personality,” pp. 26-32.

Abstract: In his theory of determination, Charles Peirce considered two processes of determination, the semiotic process and epistemology. The semiotic process is an extensional process from object to interpretant that consists of an infinite chain of references that can be spatially reversible. The epistemological process of determination is temporal and irreversible, where the idea grows into the individual mind, as the universe is unfolded by the agency of mind.

Key Words: Epistemology, Charles S. Peirce, Personality, Semiotics, Theory of Determination

Eleanor Wittrop, “Emotion Makes the Person,” pp. 33-40.

Abstract: As a lens through which to view Aristotle’s virtue theory, Jaak Panksepp’s model of basic emotional response systems illustrates how empirical work in

neuroscience can deepen our analysis of human nature. Considered in a Pankseppian framework, Aristotle's conceptions of virtue, flourishing, and eudaimonia can be transformed into concrete operational descriptions of the natural world. By adopting flourishing as a practical end to be pursued, we can bridge the gap between descriptions of functioning and normative recommendations for improvement.

Key Words: Basic Emotions; Emotion; Flourishing; Moral Psychology; Naturalized Ethics; Person; Personhood; Psychology; Systems; Virtue; Virtue Theory.

Gilbert Fulmer, "Persons, Theology and Cosmology," pp. 41-43.

Abstract: Traditional theism holds that God created all of Nature. I argue that the concept of a supernatural agent is logically incoherent; any being with an effective will must be natural. Therefore only natural evidence and knowledge are relevant to his existence. Natural evidence shows that there can be no unevolved being, no bodiless mind, no infinitely powerful being, no eternal being. Therefore, neither a supernatural nor a natural God can exist.

Key Words: Animism, Atheism, God, Naturalism, Supernaturalism

Leslie Muray, "The Emergence of Personhood and Its Importance in the Existence of the Sublime," pp. 44-47.

Abstract: Through an experience of the sublime, one can argue that personhood comes into its own or achieves its own realization. Individual persons often realize their potential as a result of a sublime experience. Unique sublime occasions are physically important because of their mathematical size or dynamical power, but the true importance of the sublime moment is of an internal and personal uniqueness. The sublime experience is a constructive force in the development of our personhood.

Key Words: aesthetic, dynamical, feeling, imagination, judgement, mathematical, personhood, reflection, sublime

Joseph C. Harry, "Quotational Characters," pp. 48-55.

Abstract: Journalists objectively keep themselves out of news stories by having highly subjective news sources do the talking, their personal perspectives displayed via quotation – through direct and indirect reported speech and thought. Conceived of as textual persons, sources function subjectively through reporters' more complex subjectified revocalizations. As such, journalists assume a prominent although murky personal voice in what nevertheless remains an objective news text. Within a semiotic/linguistic framework, I theorize the narrative interplay of objectivity and subjectivity between journalists and sources.

Key Words: icon, index, linguistics, objectivity, quotation, semiotics, subjectification, subjectivity, symbol

Martin Montoya Camacho, “Love, Identification and Equality: Rational Problems in Harry Frankfurt’s Concept of Persons,” pp. 56-60.

Abstract: Harry Frankfurt has published *On Inequality*, but this is not the first time he has written about this subject. Frankfurt already criticized a rationalistic notion of equality on other occasions (Frankfurt, 1987 & 1997). In these works he says a rationalistic notion of equality cannot fit in with our belief that agents possess their own volitional necessities, which shape volitional structures of the human will. However, Frankfurt’s explanatory connection between volitions, love and identification make it difficult to talk about personal freedom.

Key Words: inequality, moral necessities, respect, volitional structure

***Appraisal* Vol. 11, No. 2 (Winter 2017).**

Ferenc Mújdricza, “Socrates’ Daimon in the Mirror of Death,” pp. 4-12.

Abstract: In contrast to Kierkegaard’s view, I consider Socrates’ irony to be a strategy (‘The Feint of Socrates’), a scheme designed to veil, to repress, his positive, oracular intuition to protect his philosophical self, to avoid being labelled as an oracle, and to accomplish the greatest inner and external freedom possible. The fusion of the ironic philosopher with the intuitive oracle manifested itself when he revealed it in the face of death, which he did through the collectivist law-worshipping sentences of Crito and the vision-like passages on death in Phaedo.

Key Words: Daimon, death, Feint of Socrates, irony, Kierkegaard, oracle, Socrates

Daniel Paski, “Medium Emergence part One: The Personalist Theory of Emergence,” pp. 13-22.

Abstract: Although the concept of emergence is quite popular today, its original meaning – a proper medium ontological conviction between dualism and materialist monism – has faded. An epistemological, weak understanding of emergence has arisen and the possibility of ontological emergence is called into question. With a detailed examination of the notion of reduction, I will argue that reduction and emergence are not rivals and that weak and strong emergences are the two Janus faces of one proper medium emergence.

Key Words: emergence, reduction, materialism, ontology, epistemology, ontological (strong) emergence, epistemological (weak) emergence, ontological (diachronic) reduction, epistemological (synchronic) reduction

Jon M. Fennell, “Is Polanyi's Emergence Reductive?” pp. 23-35.

Abstract: Central to Michael Polanyi's account of man and nature is the concept of emergence. Whether emergence in fact exists is a vehemently debated question to which Polanyi forcefully answers in the affirmative. As recently emphasized by Thomas Nagel, a pressing issue raised by emergence is whether or not the unprecedented capacity or property can be understood in terms of more basic elements that existed before. If so, it is, to borrow from Nagel's lexicon, “reductive.” At the heart of this inquiry, then, is the question whether Polanyi's emergence is reductive. In pursuing this matter we pierce to the core of Polanyi's enduring contribution both to epistemology and philosophical anthropology as well as evolutionary theory.

Key Words: Michael Polanyi, emergence, Thomas Nagel, reductionism, evolution

John Hofbauer, “Justice, Religion, and the Human Quest for Perfect Happiness: Can Phenomenological Realism and Thomism Agree on these Issues?” pp. 36-41.

Abstract: Phenomenological realism is often perceived to be at odds with the Thomistic tradition, mainly because it rejects the scholastic categories used by Thomism. The perceived antagonism lies in certain phenomenological realists' caricature of Thomism on questions concerning the quest for happiness, the virtue of justice and the virtue of religion. There may, however, be more commensurability here than is usually anticipated. To illustrate the ways in which these schools are compatible, we highlight some frequently overlooked directions in Aquinas' thought.

Key Words: Altruism, Aquinas, Thomism, Phenomenological Realism, Dietrich von Hildebrand, self-interest, Justice, virtue of Religion, happiness

Michael A. Piel, Karen K. Johnson and Karen Putman, “Quantum Person: Collapsing the Wave Function,” pp. 42-46.

Abstract: Understanding quantum physics principles can be intellectually challenging. By providing the basics of the quantum mechanisms of duality, superposition, entanglement, and observation, sufficient groundwork is laid to ensure connections to the concept of quantum person can be recognized and understood. Looking at the behavioral dynamics of a quantum person from an ontological, epistemological, and phenomenological viewpoint allows the reader to determine whether to accept, reject, or suspend their judgment on adopting this empowering perspective.

Key Words: Quantum Person, Quantum Duality, Quantum Superposition, Quantum Entanglement, Quantum Observation

Discussion Notes: Daniel Gustafsson, “A Poet's Appeal to Personalism: A Note on *Alyosha*” (Augur Press, 2016), pp. 47-48.

Book Reviews

Dignity: Its Essential Role in Resolving Conflict, by Donna Hicks. Foreword by Archbishop Emeritus Desmond Tutu. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2011. 240 pp. ISBN 9780300188059. Reviewed by James Beauregard, pp. 49-50.

Retrieving Realism: A Contemporary Philosophical Conversation, by Hubert Dreyfus and Charles Taylor. Harvard University Press, 2015. 184 pp. ISBN 978-0674967519. Reviewed by Phil Mullins, pp. 50-51.

Struan Jacobs and Phil Mullins, “Anthropological Materials in the Making of Michael Polanyi’s Metascience,” *Perspectives on Science*. Vol. 23, No. 2, 2017: 261-285.

Abstract: Using archival and other materials, this essay documents Polanyi’s growing familiarity with anthropological literature in the forties and early fifties. It shows how Polanyi used anthropological literature to help formulate his criticisms of contemporary accounts of science as well as to develop what he came to call his “fiduciary philosophy, the constructive “post-critical” perspective he articulated in these years as an alternative to the modern critical tradition in philosophy.

Paul Lewis, *Wisdom Calls: the Moral Story of the Hebrew Bible* (Macon, GA: Nurturing Faith, Inc., 2017).

TAD Editor **Paul Lewis** recently published this book, which is intended for college classroom and adult church group use. *Wisdom Calls* argues that the Hebrew Bible invites those who study it into a process of moral development that climaxes with wisdom.

Boise Polanyi Talk

On March 27, 2017, **Jon Fennell** delivered a lecture on Polanyi for the Osher Lifelong Learning Institute at Boise State University in Boise, Idaho. Titled "Who Was Michael Polanyi and Why Is He Important to You?", the lecture was attended by nearly 200 individuals. During the two-hour event, Dr. Fennell spoke for about 90 minutes and then took questions from the audience.

Donations to the Travel Fund and/or the Richard Gelwick Fund

The Polanyi Society’s Travel Fund and the Richard Gelwick Fund enable younger scholars to participate in Society meetings. One of the Society’s goals is to involve persons who are presently, or have recently, been engaged in their academic studies. But making this happen in the midst of the increasing burden of student loans, the escalation of travel costs, and diminishing university resources available to facilitate such involvement is a daunting challenge.

Society meetings are held in different places in North America and in some years there are two meetings so demands on these Society funds are different in different years. We need continually to replenish these special funds. Please support these funds by sending a tax deductible contribution to The Polanyi Society, C/O Charles Lowney, 10 Jordan Street, Lexington, VA 24450. Checks should be made out to the Polanyi Society but marked Travel Fund and/or Gelwick Fund. You can also directly access the Polanyi Society PayPal button (<http://polanyisociety.org/paypal/donate.html>) to make a donation.

Back Printed Issues of TAD Available for Purchase

A limited number of back issues of TAD are available for purchase as long as supplies last. The cost for a copy of issues up to and including Vol. 41:3 is \$5.00. A copy of issues from 42:1 on is \$7.00. All prices include shipping and handling. For issues up to and including Vol. 39:2, contact Phil Mullins (mullins@missouriwestern.edu). For issues from 39:3 to the present, contact Paul Lewis (lewis_pa@mercer.edu). Payment should be sent to The Polanyi Society, C/O Charles Lowney, 10 Jordan Street, Lexington, VA 24450. Checks should be made out to the Polanyi Society and earmarked for back issues.

Preliminary Call for Papers

Polanyi's Legacy and Contemporary Relevance Nashotah House Conference, Nashotah, WI June 6-9, 2018

The Polanyi Society will sponsor a conference at Nashotah House, Nashotah, WI, June 6-9, 2018. Like the 2016 Polanyi Society conference at Nashotah, the 2018 conference theme will be broadly inclusive; it intends to promote the assessment and contemporary relevance of Polanyi's philosophical work. Two themes have been particularly prominent in recent discussion of Polanyi: (1) the place of Polanyi in modern Western intellectual history, including Polyanian ways of reading the intellectual history of the late modern West and Polyanian efforts to frame a "post-critical" philosophy; (2) Polanyi's understanding of emergence and the constellation of themes associated with emergence. This conference will also accommodate a wide range of other topics; a list below identifies other themes and proposed themes in recent essays and discussions. In sum, the 2018 Nashotah conference hopes to attract and draw together scholars with a wide variety of Polanyi-related interests and to link this North American conference with a similar conference in June of 2019 in Budapest, Hungary to be sponsored by the Michael Polanyi Liberal Philosophical Association.

Like the 2016 conference, the 2018 conference will likely include an opening workshop component focusing on a major Polanyi theme or a work like *Personal Knowledge*. The 2018 conference may include a presentation or a panel discussion, as recent conferences have, on a

particular topic (e.g. Polanyi's economics, Polanyi and assessment) or a widely discussed recent book.

As was the case in the 2016 Nashotah House conference, some registration or housing and travel support for participants will be available through the Richard Gelwick Fund and the Polanyi Society Travel Fund.

Updates on this Call for Papers as well as additional information on such matters as registration and housing will be posted on polanyisociety.org

Proposals for papers (or panels) and inquiries should be sent to Andrew Grosso (atgrosso@icloud.com). Proposals submitted early are appreciated, and those submitted by February 1, 2018 will be given first priority in our scheduling

The following topic areas have been proposed in recent discussion as of particular interest.

1. Polanyi and the History of Ideas
2. Postmodern, Postanalytic, and Postcritical Philosophies
3. The Open Society and Its Enemies Revisited: Polanyi's Political Liberalism and the Future of European and American Political Culture
4. Polanyi's Economic, Political and Cultural Criticism in Its Historical Context
5. Mind, Meaning and Emergence: Polanyian and Other Perspectives
5. Polanyi, the Arts and Aesthetics
6. Polanyi on Education (assessment mania; purpose, aims, traditions; strategies used to provide education [e.g., residential, distance—both synchronous and asynchronous—and hybrid])
7. Polanyi and Contemporary Science and Technology Studies
8. Polanyi and Contemporary Ethics and Value Theory

**2017 Polanyi Society Annual Meeting in Boston
Tentative Schedule
Friday-Saturday, November 17 & 18, 2017**

The final version of this schedule will not be available until late in the summer of 2017. Times of meetings will be confirmed; locations for some meetings will not be assigned until that time. As soon as final information is available, it will be posted on polanyisociety.org.

Friday, Nov. 17: Both the 10 a.m. and the 4 p.m. session of the annual meeting on Nov. 17 will be held in rooms in downtown Boston convention hotels (or the Convention Center) as assigned by the American Academy of Religion.

Polanyian Perspectives: New Voices

- 10:00-10:40 Thomas Lynn, “Biological Reductionism: Its Limitations, Its Liabilities: Recalling Michael Polanyi”
10:40-11:20 Matthew Elmore, “*Tacita Scientia*: Reading Aquinas with Michael Polanyi”
11:20-12:00 Martin Beddeleem, “Michael Polanyi: Pivotal Figure of Early Neoliberalism”

12:00-1:30 Lunch Break

1:30-3:30 Polanyi Society Board of Directors

Polanyian Perspectives

- 4:00-4:55 Jon Fennell, “Can Alasdair MacIntyre Relieve Grene’s Polanyian Regret?”
4:55-5:50 Charles Lowney, “Should We Be Pluralists or Emergentists?”
5:50-6:45 Esther Meek, “Contact with Reality: Then and Now”
6:45-7:00 Business Meeting

Saturday, Nov. 18 --9 to 3 p.m. at MIT

This 9-3 p.m. workshop will be held in Cambridge in MIT Building E51, Room 095 which is a short subway ride on the Red Line (<http://whereis.mit.edu/>) from downtown convention hotels. Further instructions about how to commute to this annual meeting session will later be posted on polanyisociety.org. The workshop schedule below is a tentative one. Updates will be posted on polanyisociety.org.

Trade, Employment, and Public Policy: Polanyi Then and Now

MIT Building E51, Room 095

Cambridge, MA, USA.

A workshop meeting organized by Anne McCants (MIT) and Eduardo Beira (MIT Portugal Program and IN+, Portugal) and convened in conjunction with the Polanyi Society 2017 Annual Meeting (Boston).

Objective and Context

Michael Polanyi published *Full Employment and Free Trade* in 1945, a book that is now much less widely remembered than his later work in the philosophy of science. The first edition was published in the United Kingdom, with a second edition appearing in 1947. An American edition

was published in 1948, with a particularly noteworthy forward by the Harvard economist Professor Gottfried Haberler (1900-1995), who had strongly encouraged the edition. Polanyi had also previously produced a documentary film for educational purposes, the first ever produced on the relatively new subject of macroeconomics. This full-length cartoon and diagrammatic film was released to the public in 1941 as the Second World War was already raging. The film is an initial strong effort to demonstrate the workings of the money and material flows critical to an understanding of macroeconomics. The film, with subtitles in several languages along with related materials, can be found here: <https://sites.google.com/site/ebeira/pol1b>). Polanyi was looking for a “suitable method of presentation” of Keynes’ new macroeconomics framework. In his introduction to the book, he says “my whole introduction to the Keynesian mechanism is based on my experience with my film audiences”. The book deals with the dynamics of the monetary flow in modern economies and offered an early introduction to the concepts later organized around the well-known “monetary circulation diagrams” in macroeconomics textbooks.

Full Employment and Free Trade explores ways to stabilize the “booms and slumps” dynamic characteristic of liberal capitalism through management of the flows of money in circulation through a variety of public policy instruments. These include the capacity of a central bank to increase the money supply or other expansionary measures targeted to maintain a stable high level of employment, a crucial concern after the difficult years of depression in the decade before WWII. Indeed, Polanyi anticipates in his book many of the most pressing monetary concerns and discussions of later decades.

More than 70 years later, the main concerns of the book are again present with renewed vigor and the originality and importance of his thought gains a new relevance, when unemployment, austerity measures (in Europe and elsewhere), and deep concerns about sovereign debt and the appropriate role for central banks are back to the core of public policy discussions in economics and among the general public. This meeting intends to discuss Polanyi’s approach (through his book and companion film) in macroeconomic history and to discuss its potential contribution to contemporary public policy discussions.

We envision this workshop as an exploratory session for an interdisciplinary group of scholars to pursue common threads of interpretation and to learn from each other’s disciplines. We strongly encourage participants to pre-circulate (by November 1st via the Polanyi Society website) a paper of no more than 20 pages in length. For those participants whose work is still truly exploratory, we request an extended abstract by the same date for the purpose of allowing all participants to have some advance knowledge of each other’s contributions. All presenters, regardless of the length of the pre-circulated material, should however limit their speaking time to no more than 15 minutes to allow for 10 minutes discussion with each presentation. The organizers are open to the possibility of organizing a collected publication agenda pursuant to the outcome of the workshop.

Tentative Program Schedule

9:00 Opening: Phil Mullins, President of Polanyi Society

9:05 - 10:20 Session #1

9:05-9:30 Struan Jacobs (Deakin University, Australia--by video conference), *Projects of social betterment: Michael Polanyi's economic film contrasted to Otto Neurath's isotype system*

9:30-9:55 Nilanjan Raghunath (Singapore University of Technology and Design), *Reaching full employment in the digital economy – lessons learnt from Polanyi*

9:55-10:20 Anne McCants (MIT), *What might a moral economics look like? Lessons from Adam Smith and Michael Polanyi*

10:20 - 10:35 coffee break

10:35-10:55 Walter Gulick (Montana State University Billings) *Michael and Karl Polanyi: Politico-Economic Point, Counterpoint—Is Rapprochement Possible?*

10:55-11:20 Gabor Biro (Budapest University of Technology and Economics, Hungary--by video conference), *Projecting the Light of Democracy: Michael Polanyi's Efforts to Save Liberalism Via an Economics Film*

11:20 -12:30: Session #2: Graduate Student Panel

Erik Stayton, MIT,

Jordan Howell, Harvard

Jamie Wong, MIT

J. Michael Wahlen, MIT

12:30—1:15: Lunch provided on site (send reservations to amccants@mit.edu)

1:15—2:30: Session #3

1:15—1:40 Marta Felis-Rota (Autonomous University of Madrid, Spain--by video conference), *Michael Polanyi's Full Employment and Free Trade In the Context of the Second World War*

1:40—2:05 Eduardo Beira (MIT Portugal Program and IN+, Portugal), *Experimentation in economics (1930's and 40's): producing a film to learn in order to write a book*

2:05—2:30: Agnès Festré (University of Nice Sophia Antipolis, France--by video conference), *Michael Polanyi's economics: A strange rapprochement between Hayek and*

Keynes.

2:30 –3:00: Session #4: Final Discussion

3:00 Conclusion

Workshop Resources

Full Employment and Free Trade, by Michael Polanyi

Access to materials listed below is conditional. If you wish to have access to any of the files for non-commercial personal and/or academic purposes, you can access it by clicking on the link and initiating the request with the Google Drive message ("Request access"). Later you will receive e-mail with instructions about how to gain access. Corrections and comments are welcomed (ebeira@gmail.com)

English edition (2nd ed., 1948) (<https://archive.org/details/in.ernet.dli.2015.228994>)

American edition (1948), pages i to xiii ([pdf](#))

Unemployment and money. The principles involved. A diagrammatic sound film by Michael Polanyi (1940)

See the film and related materials, including subtitles in several languages, [here](#)